



---

**COMPLAINT AND REQUEST FOR INVESTIGATION OF  
MEDICAL AID FOR PALESTINIANS  
(REGISTERED CHARITY NUMBER 1045315)**

---

**1. INTRODUCTION**

- 1.1. This is a complaint to the Charity Commission regarding Medical Aid for Palestinians, a company limited by guarantee (registered in England and Wales under no. 03038352) which is registered as a charity with the Charity Commission (registered no. 1045315).
- 1.2. MAP had an annual income of over £5.4 million in the year to 31 December 2017 of which nearly £1 million (17%) was spent “raising funds”. A substantial part of the money spent “raising funds” may have been spent on the propaganda described below.
- 1.3. MAP’s charitable objects are:
- a) The relief of poverty and the prevention and relief of sickness amongst inhabitants of the Middle East region, refugees and other displaced persons and in particular those refugees displaced from the former British Mandate of Palestine
  - b) The advancement of education amongst inhabitants of the Middle East Region, refugees and other displaced persons and in particular those refugees displaced from the former British Mandate of Palestine.
- 1.4. These charitable objects do not include medical care for injuries caused by armed conflict (since this is not “relief of sickness”), still less propaganda relating to armed conflict.
- 1.5. This complaint concerns in particular:
- a) MAP’s links with and funding of NGOs linked to the Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine (PFLP), a terrorist organisation, designated as such by the UK<sup>1</sup>, US<sup>2</sup>, EU<sup>3</sup>, Canada<sup>4</sup>, Israel and other countries. These links are discussed in section 2 below.
  - b) Inaccurate and misleading content on MAP’s website and in its reports and “fact sheets”. These materials promote racist hatred and mislead donors by false claims regarding the medical situation in the Palestinian Territories. They also extend to political propaganda that is outside MAP’s charitable objects as well as being misleading. Examples of the problems with some of these materials are examined in sections 3-6 below. These

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/financial-sanctions-consolidated-list-of-targets/consolidated-list-of-targets>

<sup>2</sup> <https://www.state.gov/j/ct/rls/other/des/123085.htm>

<sup>3</sup> <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32016D1136&qid=1474969819578&from=EN>

<sup>4</sup> <https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/ntnl-scrnt/cntr-trrrsm/lstd-ntts/crrnt-lstd-ntts-en.aspx#2042>

examples are not exhaustive but amply suffice to substantiate this aspect of the complaint.

- c) MAP's promotion of the antisemitic play, "*Seven Jewish Children – A Play for Gaza*" discussed in section 7 below.

#### 1.6. MAP's conduct

- a) undermines public trust and confidence in MAP and brings the charitable sector into disrepute;
- b) is contrary to the public benefit as it stokes hatred of Israel and Jews and encourages antisemitism;
- c) misuses charitable funds to promote terrorism and political propaganda; and
- d) misleads donors and the public generally.

- 1.7. We ask the Charity Commission to take appropriate steps to secure the proper administration of this charity and to ensure that its conduct is limited to activities for the public benefit within its charitable objects.

## 2. TERRORIST LINKS

- 2.1. MAP has links with and funds NGOs that are linked to the Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine (PFLP). PFLP is designated as a terrorist organization by the UK as well as the USA, EU, Canada, Australia, Israel and other countries<sup>5</sup>. PFLP is involved in suicide bombings, hijackings, and assassinations, amongst other terrorist activities targeting civilians.

- 2.2. These links do not further MAP's charitable objects, are contrary to the public benefit, and are liable to undermine public trust and confidence in MAP and charities generally.

### **Addameer**

- 2.3. MAP's links with Addameer include:

- a) MAP worked closely with Addameer and relied on evidence from Addameer when it co-published a report on the 2014 Gaza War entitled "*No More Impunity*".<sup>6</sup>
- b) On 25 November 2016 MAP publicised Addameer's meeting with Parliamentarians and promoted an event involving Addameer speaking at a film screening about human rights and humanitarian issues faced by Palestinian prisoners.<sup>7</sup>
- c) In May 2017 Palestinian prisoners commenced a hunger strike, and MAP publicised statements from Addameer on their website, urging Israel to "*cease human rights violations against prisoners*"

---

<sup>5</sup> See notes 1-4 above

<sup>6</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/downloads/no-more-impunity--gaza-health-sector-under-attack.pdf>

<sup>7</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/466-call-to-action-ask-your-mp-to-support-access-to-healthcare-for-palestinian-prisoners>

d) On 19 May 2017 MAP quoted Addameer in a news story in which Addameer and other organisations urged Israel to “*cease its ongoing, systematic human rights violations against the hunger-strikers*”.<sup>8</sup>

2.4. Addameer is an official PFLP affiliate<sup>9</sup>. Addameer’s senior officials are also officials of PFLP.

a) Abdullatif Ghaith, Chair of Addameer<sup>10</sup>, was described by Miftah (another Palestinian NGO) as a representative of PFLP.<sup>11</sup> He was banned from entering the West Bank from 2011 to 2015 due to Israel’s security concerns.<sup>12</sup>

b) Khalida Jarrar, Addameer’s vice chair<sup>13</sup>, is also a senior PFLP official. She is described by the PFLP website as its leader.<sup>14</sup> On 15 April 2015 she was indicted<sup>15</sup> for various offences including active membership of a terrorist organization (the PFLP) and inciting violence through a call to kidnap Israeli soldiers to be used as “*bargaining chips for the release of Palestinian prisoners.*” She was released from prison on 3 June 2016 but was re-arrested and placed in administrative detention in July 2017.

c) On 3 June 2013 Ayman Nasser, Addameer legal co-ordinator<sup>16</sup>, was convicted by the Judea Military Court.<sup>17</sup> He had admitted to being a member of PFLP and providing services to the organization.

d) Sumoud Saadat, Addameer’s field researcher<sup>18</sup>, is the daughter of PFLP general secretary Ahmad Saadat. He is currently serving a prison sentence in Israel, having been convicted in 2008 by an Israeli military court for heading an illegal terrorist organization.<sup>19</sup>

e) On 23 February 2017 Anas Barghouthi, a lawyer for Addameer, signed a plea bargain to avoid prison in relation to his alleged membership of the PFLP.<sup>20</sup>

### **The Palestinian Centre for Human Rights (PCHR)**

2.5. MAP’s links with PCHR include:

a) MAP is one of PCHR’s funders. PCHR’s 2016 Annual Report lists MAP as one of its funders who have made a “generous contribution”.<sup>21</sup> PCHR’s 2015 Annual Report also states that MAP made a “generous contribution” to its funding.<sup>22</sup>

<sup>8</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/659-palestinian-prisoners-a-health-deteriorates-as-the-hunger-strike-enters-its-second-month->

<sup>9</sup> [https://web.archive.org/web/20150924010641/http://www.fatehorg.ps/index.php?action=show\\_page&ID=11455&lang=ar](https://web.archive.org/web/20150924010641/http://www.fatehorg.ps/index.php?action=show_page&ID=11455&lang=ar)

<sup>10</sup> <http://www.addameer.org/about/board-general-assembly>

<sup>11</sup> <http://www.miftah.org/Display.cfm?DocId=4181&CategoryId=11> 2004 article

<sup>12</sup> <http://samidoun.ca/2014/10/prisoner-rights-leader-abdul-latif-ghaith-banned-from-entering-the-west-bank-or-leaving-palestine/>

<sup>13</sup> <http://www.addameer.org/about/board-general-assembly>

<sup>14</sup> <http://pflp.ps/english/2017/07/15/pflp-ordering-the-leader-comrade-khalida-jarrar-to-administrative-detention-will-not-suppress-the-resistance/>

<sup>15</sup> <http://www.law.idf.il/163-7238-he/Patzar.aspx>

<sup>16</sup> <http://www.addameer.org/about/our-staff>

<sup>17</sup> <http://www.law.idf.il/261-5815-he/Patzar.aspx>

<sup>18</sup> <http://www.addameer.org/about/our-staff>

<sup>19</sup> <http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-3644555,00.html>

<sup>20</sup> <http://www.maannews.com/Content.aspx?ID=775626>

<sup>21</sup> [http://pchrgaza.org/en/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/PCHR-Annual\\_2016.pdf](http://pchrgaza.org/en/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/PCHR-Annual_2016.pdf) page 4

<sup>22</sup> <http://pchrgaza.org/en/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/annual-english2015.pdf>

- b) On 19 December 2017 a MAP news story quoted PCHR figures regarding numbers of Palestinians allegedly injured during riots and also quoted PCHR raising concerns about alleged “*indiscriminate use of excessive and disproportionate force against Palestinian civilians*”.<sup>23</sup> MAP is effectively operating as a mouthpiece for PCHR.
- c) On 12 January 2018 another MAP news story quoted PCHR alleging excessive use by Israeli forces of live ammunition “*to confront the unarmed civilians ... in peaceful and non-violent protests*”.<sup>24</sup> Again MAP is publicising the views of PCHR.
- 2.6. PCHR is a key supporter and affiliate of the terrorist group PFLP. Raji Sourani, founder and director of PCHR has strong links with PFLP. In an interview with the Washington Post he admitted his past links with PFLP.<sup>25</sup> In February 2014 PFLP organised a ceremony in Gaza, during which Dr Rabah Muhana, a Member of PFLP’s Political Bureau, awarded Sourani the “*alternative Nobel prize*”. Dr Muhana delivered a speech honouring Sourani for “*his distinctive role in defending human rights and for conveying the message of our people and their suffering.*”<sup>26</sup>
- 2.7. Although it labels itself as a human rights organization, PCHR frequently calls attacks on Israeli civilians “*legal forms of resistance*”. PCHR offers a distorted view of events, ignoring any reference to terrorist activity by Palestinians, and demonising Israelis.
- a) On 13 October 2015 PCHR issued a press release<sup>27</sup> accusing Israel of a series of “*crimes*” in confronting a number of Palestinian terrorists carrying out stabbing attacks. The attackers, portrayed by PCHR as innocent victims, had committed attempted murder in front of dozens of witnesses, leaving behind multiple victims, including children and the elderly. Referring to Israel’s killing of individuals who were in the midst of carrying out attacks against Israeli civilians, PCHR condemned “*with the strongest terms the Israeli forces’ disregard for the lives of Palestinian civilians.*”
- b) On 12 March 2018 PCHR issued a statement<sup>28</sup> that called upon “*the international community, including the High Contracting Parties to the 1949 Fourth Geneva Convention, to intervene to stop all Israeli violations against fishermen and allow them to fish freely in the Gaza Sea*”. A number of fishermen near Rafah had been arrested, and the incident was described by the PCHR as “*Israeli ongoing attacks against Palestinian fishermen*”. However, the background to that story was made public on 4 April 2018.<sup>29</sup> The fishermen were actually members of the Islamic Jihad terror group, who planned to sink an Israeli naval patrol boat and kidnap survivors.
- c) PCHR refers to Palestinian “*civilians*” being killed<sup>30</sup> by the Israeli army during the “*peace camp*” disturbances at the Gaza border on 30 March 2018, when in fact the majority of those killed were terrorist operatives violently attempting to breach the border. As at 4 April 2018, 15 of the 19 killed had been identified as terror organisation members.<sup>31</sup>
- 2.8. MAP echoes PCHR’s blatantly distorted anti-Israel view of events, amplifies its views and provides funding to them.

<sup>23</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/766-medical-aid-for-palestinians-map-calls-for-accountability-for-violations-against-medical-teams-and-killing-of-palestinians-including-double-amputee-by-israeli-security-forces>

<sup>24</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/783-further-palestinians-shot-dead-due-to-apparent-excessive-use-of-lethal-force>

<sup>25</sup> <http://www.wrmea.org/1995-september/a-matter-of-principle-gaza-human-rights-lawyer-raji-sourani.html>

<sup>26</sup> <http://pchgaza.org/en/?p=858>

<sup>27</sup> <http://pchgaza.org/en/?p=1478>

<sup>28</sup> <https://pchgaza.org/en/?p=10486>

<sup>29</sup> <https://www.timesofisrael.com/shin-bet-idf-thwart-islamic-jihad-attack-on-navy-boats-off-gaza-coast/>

<sup>30</sup> <https://pchgaza.org/en/?p=10576>

<sup>31</sup> <http://honestreporting.com/exposed-more-palestinian-victims-identified-as-terror-org-members/>

## Al Haq

2.9. MAP's links with Al Haq are as follows:

- a) MAP relied on evidence from Al Haq when it co-published a report on the 2014 Gaza War entitled "*No More Impunity*"<sup>32</sup>.
- b) When MAP took a group of British MPs on a tour around the West Bank in October 2017, it arranged meetings with Al Haq.<sup>33</sup>
- c) In April 2017 MAP supported a delegation of "Palestinian and Israeli human rights defenders to London"; some of its members came from Al Haq<sup>34</sup>
- d) In April 2017 MAP organised a panel discussion with "human rights defenders" including Nada Kiswanson van Hooydonk, Senior Legal Advocacy Officer and Head of Al Haq's Europe office, to discuss "*longstanding and systemic impunity for violations of international law*".<sup>35</sup>

2.10. Evidence of Al Haq's links with the PFLP includes:

- a) Al Haq's General Director, Shawan Jabarin, was convicted in 1985 for recruiting members for the PFLP and arranging PFLP training outside Israel.<sup>36</sup> In 1994 Jabarin was again arrested for PFLP links and placed in administrative detention for 6 months. The Israeli government stated that he "*had not discontinued his terrorist involvement and maintains his position in the leadership of the PFLP.*"
- b) In 2007, the Israeli Supreme Court rejected Jabarin's appeal<sup>37</sup> to go abroad stating that "*The objections by security forces are all rooted in security concerns based on classified information, showing that the petitioner is a senior activist in the PFLP terror group....the current petitioner is apparently acting as a manner of Doctor Jekyll and Mister Hyde, acting some of the time as the CEO of a human rights organization, and at other times as an activist in a terror organization which has not shied away from murder and attempted murder, which have nothing to do with rights...*"
- c) In 2009, Jabarin was again prohibited by the Israeli authorities from travelling abroad. The Israeli Supreme Court rejected his appeal<sup>38</sup> stating: "*We found that the material pointing to the petitioner's involvement in the activity of terrorist entities is concrete and reliable material. We also found that additional negative material concerning the petitioner has been added even after his previous petition was rejected.*"

---

<sup>32</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/downloads/no-more-impunity--gazas-health-sector-under-attack.pdf>

<sup>33</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/733-mps-witness-barriers-to-health-and-dignity-in-the-west-bank>

<sup>34</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/642-hunger-striking-palestinian-prisoners-protest-lack-of-access-to-medical-care>

<sup>35</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/632-join-map-for-a-panel-discussion-with-palestinian-and-israeli-human-rights-defenders-in-pursuit-of-accountability>

<sup>36</sup> <http://web.archive.org/web/20090129205347/http://domino.un.org/unispal.nsf/85255db800470aa485255d8b004e349a/4f4e2d2311ab624485256c53006afa92!OpenDocument>

<sup>37</sup> [http://www.ngo-monitor.org/nm/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/Jabarin-2007-decision-translation\\_NGO-Monitor-aug2016.pdf](http://www.ngo-monitor.org/nm/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/Jabarin-2007-decision-translation_NGO-Monitor-aug2016.pdf)

<sup>38</sup> <http://www.ngo-monitor.org/nm/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/PFLP-Report-English.pdf>

- d) Several Al-Haq staff members including Ziad Hamidan, Naser Rayyes, a Legal Researcher and Yousef Qawariq have also had their travel limited by the Israeli authorities for security reasons.<sup>39</sup>
- 2.11. Al Haq has advocated<sup>40</sup> sabotaging the Israeli justice system by “flooding the [Israeli Supreme] Court with petitions in the hope of obstructing its functioning and resources.”
- 2.12. Al Haq openly supports the payment of salaries to convicted terrorists. In July 2017, Al-Haq asserted that convicted terrorists have a “right” to receive salaries from the PA, and Jabarin stated that “If their rights are eroded we are heading for a real crisis in Palestinian society and in due course toward an explosion.”<sup>41</sup>

### David Duke

- 2.13. MAP’s founder and honorary patron, Dr Swee Ang, has distributed and encouraged others to distribute an openly antisemitic video of David Duke, a white supremacist and former Ku Klux Klan Grand Wizard.
- a) On 14 August 2014 Dr Swee Ang, forwarded an email<sup>42</sup> to Dr Paola Manduca, which was headed “CNN, Goldman Sachs and the Zio Matrix”. It contained a link to a video made by David Duke.
- b) Dr Ang wrote in her email, “This is shocking video please watch. This is not about Palestine – it is about all of us!” The email also contained, in bold red lettering, “SEE THIS VIDEO BEFORE IT IS REMOVED FROM CIRCULATION – Please do pass on to others who you think would be interested and would pass on>>>The whole world needs to know”
- c) The video is described on Duke’s YouTube page as “reveal[ing] how the Zionist Matrix of Power controls Media, Politics and Banking and how each Part of this Tribalistic matrix supports and protects each other!”
- d) The video labels the Federal Reserve Bank as “the Zio Club FED,” calls NBC News anchor Brian Williams a “good Shabbez goy Zioscript reader,” identifies U.S. Supreme Court Justice Elena Kagan as a “Zio tribalistic,” and states, “Zios invaded and took over Walt Disney Corp. just as they invaded and took over Palestine.”
- e) In February 2017, when asked about the antisemitic video<sup>43</sup> at the University College of London Union, Dr Ang responded that she doesn’t “think it’s entirely anti-Jewish.”
- f) The Daily Telegraph<sup>44</sup> reported Dr Swee Ang as saying: “I didn’t know who David Duke was, or that he was connected to the Ku Klux Klan. I am concerned that if there is any truth in the video, that Jews control the media, politics and banking, what on earth is going on? I was worried.”
- 2.14. The Ku Klux Klan (KKK) is a racist, anti-Semitic movement with a commitment to extreme violence and terrorism to achieve its goals of racial segregation and white supremacy.

<sup>39</sup> <https://www.fidh.org/IMG/pdf/il395a.pdf> pages 11–12

<sup>40</sup> <http://www.alhaq.org/publications/publications-index/item/legitimising-the-illegitimate> page 50

<sup>41</sup> <https://www.al-monitor.com/pulse/afp/2017/07/israel-palestinians-conflict-prisoners-us-politics.html>

<sup>42</sup> <https://www.ngo-monitor.org/data/images/File/CNN%20Goldman%20Sachs%20&%20the%20Zio%20Matrix.pdf>

<sup>43</sup> <https://www.facebook.com/UCLUFOP/videos/2217720711785957/>

<sup>44</sup> <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/health/news/11112930/Lancet-hijacked-in-anti-Israel-campaign.html>

2.15. Despite the clear antisemitism displayed in the email by which Dr Ang circulated the video, the disgraceful content of the video itself, and Dr Ang's dissembling excuses, she remains an "honorary patron" of MAP. This in itself brings the charity into disrepute.

### 3. WEB PAGE – "THE ISSUES"

3.1. One of the main pages of MAP's website is entitled "THE ISSUES"<sup>45</sup>. It sets out a series of seriously misleading statements under the heading "Occupied Palestinian Territory":

***"Half a Century of Israeli occupation continues to constitute a major obstacle to the availability, accessibility and quality of health care for Palestinians"***

3.2. This statement implies that for the past 50 years, Palestinians' health care has been adversely affected by the Israeli occupation. However, the opposite is true: Palestinian health and healthcare have improved enormously over the past 50 years.

3.3. It should be noted that Israel had responsibility for healthcare in the West Bank and Gaza from 1967 to 1995 and after that date the Palestinian Authority took over responsibility for healthcare, in line with the Oslo Accords.<sup>46</sup>

3.4. The following information shows how the Palestinians' health has improved over the past 50 years:

a) A 1994 research paper by Dr Wael R. Ennab of Al-Najah University, in the West Bank on *"The population and demographic developments in the West Bank and Gaza until 1990"*<sup>47</sup> found that the average life expectancy had risen considerably following the period when Israel took control. The life expectancy at birth for both sexes was estimated at 48 in the period 1960-1965, when Jordan was in occupation of the West Bank. This rose to around 55 in 1975, and to 65 for males and 67 years for females in 1984.<sup>48</sup> Palestinians in the West Bank and Gaza had made a net gain of life expectancy of 14 years over a 15-year period of Israeli rule.

b) Today the life expectancy for Palestinians in Gaza and the West Bank is 74.<sup>49</sup> This is higher than Egypt (73), and comparable to Scotland<sup>50</sup>, where men have a life expectancy of 71 and women of 78.

c) The infant mortality rate (IMR) of Palestinians also improved considerably after 1967. It fell from around 160 per 1,000 live births in 1967 to 132 per 1,000 in 1974<sup>51</sup> and then dropped more rapidly to about 55 in the Gaza Strip, and about 60 in the West Bank in 1985<sup>52</sup>. Israeli estimates of IMRs in the West Bank and Gaza Strip suggest figures of 150 prior to 1967, 100 in the mid-1970s and 70 per 1,000 in the early 1980s<sup>53</sup>. Today the infant mortality rate in Gaza is 16.6 per thousand live births.<sup>54</sup> This is lower than in Egypt (19 per thousand) and Turkey (17.6 per thousand).

---

<sup>45</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/the-issues/the-issues>

<sup>46</sup> <http://www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/foreignpolicy/peace/guide/pages/the%20israeli-palestinian%20interim%20agreement%20-%20annex%20iii.aspx>

<sup>47</sup> <https://unispal.un.org/DPA/DPR/unispal.nsf/0/E06D649D586D1D05852562AE00725B26>

<sup>48</sup> United States Bureau of Census, 1985, p. 145

<sup>49</sup> <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/fields/2102.html#138>

<sup>50</sup> <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-scotland-38142537>

<sup>51</sup> U.O. Schmelz, *et al.*, 1977, p. 76

<sup>52</sup> S. Vermund, *et al.*, 1985, p. 26

<sup>53</sup> Israel Ministry of Health, 1986

<sup>54</sup> <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/gz.html>

- d) Dr Samir Hazboun of Bir-Zeit University in the West Bank studied developments in social services in the West Bank and Gaza Strip from 1967-1990<sup>55</sup>. He found that the ratio of population to doctors in the West Bank improved from 1,203 persons per doctor in 1985 to 891 in 1990. In 1990, the Gaza Strip registered a ratio of around 900 persons per doctor. The Palestinian Authority's current statistics show 588 persons per doctor.<sup>56</sup> Therefore there has been a significant improvement in the ratio of doctors to population since Israel's "occupation".
- e) The Israeli Ministry of Health supervisor in the West Bank and Gaza from 1980 to 1994, Dr TH Tulchinsky, wrote a letter published in the British Medical Journal setting out the improvements made to the Palestinian health during this period.<sup>57</sup>
- i. *"During this period, the Israeli authorities, working with senior Palestinian professionals, adopted health programs which made a major improvement in health of the Palestinian population, with a focus on infants, children and women."*
  - ii. *The immunization program in the West Bank and Gaza for the Palestinian population prior to 1967 was poor, and was given top priority during the 1970s reaching equivalence to, and in some cases better than, the Israeli immunization program. Control was established of epidemics of poliomyelitis and measles as well as a massive reduction of tetanus and diarrhoeal disease hospitalizations and mortality."*
  - iii. *"The Israeli governmental health service provided visiting immunization teams to all villages in the West Bank without onsite clinics. The Gaza population was served by government or UNRWA clinics with vaccines provided by the Israeli Ministry of Health. Rural primary care was provided in the 10 cities and over 450 villages in the West Bank in 1992 with 147 government clinics, 51 village health rooms, 20 UNRWA clinics, 131 NGO clinics and 152 private clinics. In the 1980s an innovative Village Health Guide program was developed by the Israeli Ministry of Health with UNICEF help under the local management of Palestinian health personnel. By 1994 this program had brought primary care to some 90 small villages previously served only by visiting immunization teams."*
  - iv. *"The Israeli administration arranged massive training programs for medical personnel and nurses from hospitals and community based services that were carried out in Israeli hospitals with parallel development of dialysis centers in all government hospitals in the West Bank and Gaza. As an example, anesthesiologists were trained for 3 years in Israeli hospitals and returned to upgrade this vital service in all government hospitals in the WB and Gaza. From 1985, infants attending governmental clinics received vitamins A, D and iron supplements, resulting in improved growth patterns."*
  - v. *"Many developments from that period were carried on after the 1994 turnover of health services to the Palestinian Authority. Some programs such as the village health rooms were expanded by the Palestinian Authority. Sadly some of the important innovations of that period were dropped by the PA such as routine vitamin A, D and iron supplements for infants, possibly explaining findings of stunting in children in recent years."*

<sup>55</sup> [http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/ecdcseud7\\_en.pdf](http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/ecdcseud7_en.pdf)

<sup>56</sup> <http://www.pcbs.gov.ps/Downloads/book2261.pdf>

<sup>57</sup> <https://www.bmj.com/rapid-response/2011/10/31/health-developments-west-bank-and-gaza-during-israeli-administration>

***“The movement of medical professionals seeking to train and improve their skills, and vital medical equipment deemed a risk to Israel’s security, are often also restricted by the occupation.”***

- 3.5. These claims are misleading; on the contrary, Israel facilitates the training of Palestinian medical professionals.
- 3.6. Israel operates, through its Ministry of Defence, a department called the Co-ordination of Government Activities in the Territories (COGAT) which works closely with the Palestinian Ministry of Health to support the medical needs of the population of the West Bank and Gaza. The responsibilities of COGAT are set out in its website.<sup>58</sup> COGAT organises many projects for training Palestinian doctors, in order to improve medical treatment for Palestinians. Some recent examples are as follows:
  - a) Palestinian doctors, trained in Israel, travel from St. John's Hospital in Jerusalem to Gaza every two months to perform corneal transplant surgery at a new branch of the St John's Eye hospital in Gaza. Now patients no longer have to leave Gaza for this life saving treatment. 60 such operations were performed in Gaza from January to November 2017.<sup>59</sup>
  - b) A group of female Palestinian doctors have been trained in the Hadassah hospital in Jerusalem, to gain experience in innovative technology and advanced medical techniques. The Hadassah hospital has a new internships and advanced training scheme for Palestinian physicians who return to their hospitals in the West Bank bringing their new skills.<sup>60</sup>
  - c) In 2017 a special ultrasound course for 33 Palestinian doctors from the West Bank and Gaza was held in the Soroka Hospital in Beer Sheva, Israel. The course, which dealt with the use of ultrasound for patients during anaesthesia and with unstable circulatory systems, was intended to improve the quality of medical care for Palestinians.<sup>61</sup>
- 3.7. A report by the Israeli Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) dated February 2016<sup>62</sup> stated that there were 1,700 crossings of Palestinians from the West Bank to Israel in 2015 to participate in professional health care workshops, exhibitions, and seminars in Israel and abroad. COGAT co-ordinated 10 professional health care workshops in Israel for Palestinian medical teams. Another report by the MFA dated 24 September 2015 stated: *“Israel has continued and even improved movement for medical purposes. Israel has coordinated the movement of almost 650 doctors and medical teams from the Gaza Strip to the West Bank for continuing education projects and conferences.”*<sup>63</sup>
- 3.8. The Peres Peace Centre in Israel has provided advanced training to over 250 Palestinian doctors and medical personnel in Israeli hospitals. Based on the training needs of the Palestinian healthcare system, medical trainees participate in residencies and fellowships in Israel's leading hospitals for up to five years. They live in Israel, learn Hebrew and become part of the Israeli hospital medical. After training, the doctors return to the Palestinian hospitals, significantly increasing the capacities of the Palestinian healthcare system.

<sup>58</sup> <http://www.cogat.mod.gov.il/en/about/Pages/default.aspx>

<sup>59</sup> [http://www.cogat.mod.gov.il/en/Our\\_Activities/Pages/Gaza-Corneal-Transplants-15.11.17.aspx](http://www.cogat.mod.gov.il/en/Our_Activities/Pages/Gaza-Corneal-Transplants-15.11.17.aspx)

<sup>60</sup> [http://www.cogat.mod.gov.il/en/Our\\_Activities/Pages/Women-Doctors-Hadassah-Hospital-.aspx](http://www.cogat.mod.gov.il/en/Our_Activities/Pages/Women-Doctors-Hadassah-Hospital-.aspx)

<sup>61</sup> [http://www.cogat.mod.gov.il/en/Our\\_Activities/Pages/Ultrasound-Course-for-Palestinian-Doctors-5.12.17.aspx](http://www.cogat.mod.gov.il/en/Our_Activities/Pages/Ultrasound-Course-for-Palestinian-Doctors-5.12.17.aspx)

<sup>62</sup> <http://embassies.gov.il/MFA/FOREIGNPOLICY/Peace/HUMANITARIAN/Pages/Israeli-aid-to-the-Palestinians-COGAT-update-February-2016.aspx>

<sup>63</sup> <http://embassies.gov.il/MFA/FOREIGNPOLICY/Peace/HUMANITARIAN/Pages/Reconstruction-in-Gaza-Sept-2015.aspx>

- 3.9. Recent disputes between Hamas and the Palestinian Authority have significantly restricted the movement of medical personnel for training.<sup>64</sup>
- 3.10. Israel does not restrict the supply of medicines to Gaza<sup>65</sup> Supplies are available if ordered at very short notice and can be delivered in 24 hours. Gaza's recent problems regarding medical supplies have nothing to do with the Israeli restrictions. In June 2017<sup>66</sup> it was reported that the Palestinian Authority had not sent any shipments of medicine or medical equipment to the Gaza Strip for more than three months, causing severe shortages. At that time Gazan hospitals could no longer obtain one third of essential medicines and more than 270 medical equipment items needed for operating rooms. Abbas was accused of cutting medical aid to Gaza by more than 90% in June 2017.<sup>67</sup>
- 3.11. Gaza has many other problems regarding medical equipment, according to a report on "Medical Equipment in Gaza's hospitals"<sup>68</sup> by the World Health Organisation (WHO).
- a) A significant proportion of the foreign donations were not solicited and were surplus to actual needs or did not meet Palestinian Ministry of Health (MoH) standards. In 2009 an estimated 500 tons of medical equipment was idle in warehouses across Gaza. At one point the area lacked a single working MRI scanner as no donor was available to pay for a replacement spare part.
  - b) WHO reported that donations of medical equipment that passed through the Israeli crossings into Gaza were coordinated with the MoH regarding technical advice and specifications and so were useful and suitable. However, those coming from Egypt via the Rafah crossing had not been co-ordinated and were usually unsuitable for use in Gaza, and added extra burdens to the system.
  - c) There were organisational problems with the Gaza Health service including no inventories of medical equipment, no central procurement, confusion of tasks and lack of suitable tools, and lack of training for maintenance workers.
- 3.12. It is correct that the entry of some dual-use equipment that could be used by Hamas for military purposes is restricted by Israel. Items such as image diagnostic devices are allowed in only after careful scrutiny. Transfers of dual-use equipment are often restricted, not just by Israel, to prevent them being used for terrorism. The EU, for example, produces a list of dual-use equipment whose export is restricted.<sup>69</sup>

***"Life under occupation also brings with it direct risks to health and life for the 4.4 million residents of the oPt, including violent attacks from illegal Israeli settlers"***

- 3.13. The suggestion that 4.4 million residents of the oPt are at risk of violent attacks from "*illegal Israeli settlers*" is grossly misleading. Quite apart from the fact that the description of Israeli residents of Judea and Samaria (the West Bank) as "illegal" is disputed, the number of attacks by a tiny and extreme minority of them on Palestinians is absolutely minimal: there were 6 injuries caused by such attacks in the first half of 2017, 2 in the whole of 2016, 8 in 2015 and 9 in 2014.<sup>70</sup> This misleading allegation is evidently included solely for the purpose of political propaganda and not to further MAP's charitable objects.

<sup>64</sup> <https://www.timesofisrael.com/pa-blamed-as-3-gazan-babies-die-after-denied-permits-to-enter-israel/>

<sup>65</sup> <http://embassies.gov.il/UnGeneva/NewsAndEvents/Pages/Humanitarian-situation-Gaza-Nov-2012.aspx>

<sup>66</sup> <http://www.jpost.com/Middle-East/PA-has-not-sent-medical-shipments-to-Gaza-for-over-three-months-496999>

<sup>67</sup> <https://www.timesofisrael.com/pa-blamed-as-3-gazan-babies-die-after-denied-permits-to-enter-israel/>

<sup>68</sup> [http://www.emro.who.int/images/stories/palestine/documents/pdf/Medical\\_equipment\\_in\\_Gaza\\_EB\\_reportJuly09.pdf](http://www.emro.who.int/images/stories/palestine/documents/pdf/Medical_equipment_in_Gaza_EB_reportJuly09.pdf)

<sup>69</sup> [Http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2008/september/tradoc\\_140595.pdf](Http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/docs/2008/september/tradoc_140595.pdf)

<sup>70</sup> <https://www.ochaopt.org/content/increase-settler-violence-during-first-half-2017>

- 3.14. By contrast, during the first half of 2017, the OCHA recorded 172 incidents resulting in injuries or damage to property of Israeli settlers in the West Bank. 95% of these incidents consisted of stone-throwing at vehicles travelling in the West Bank, and the remainder involved the throwing of Molotov cocktails and shootings. As a result, 49 Israeli settlers were injured and dozens of cars were damaged.
- 3.15. 20 Israelis were killed and 169 were wounded in 99 terrorist attacks originating in the West Bank in 2017<sup>71</sup>, up from 17 killed and 263 injured in 269 attacks in 2016. 28 Israelis were killed and another 360 wounded in 226 attacks in 2015. 93 Israelis were killed and 882 wounded in the 100 terrorist attacks originating in the West Bank in 2014.

#### 4. MAP'S BREAST CANCER FACTSHEET

- 4.1. MAP ran a campaign entitled "*Breast Cancer in Occupied Palestine*" commencing in October 2016. The campaign featured prominently on its website at that time and a breast cancer "fact sheet"<sup>72</sup> remains on the website at the date of this report. In it MAP blames deaths of Palestinian women from breast cancer on "*the occupation*" and claims that "*The only effective way to remove the obstacles to better care is to end the occupation*". This false allegation stirs up hatred of Israelis and Jews in a manner reminiscent of mediaeval blood libels and Nazi tropes.

##### **Misleading comparison between Palestinian territories and the UK or Israel**

- 4.2. The "fact sheet" states on its first page: "*Breast cancer is one of the best understood, and most treatable, forms of cancer. In the UK, far more women now survive the disease than die from it, with 81 percent of women living beyond five years after being diagnosed. In Israel, the five-year survival rate is higher still, at over 86%. For Palestinian women living under military occupation for nearly 50 years, the situation is far bleaker. Breast cancer is the most common cancer among Palestinian women, but for those diagnosed with the disease, estimates of five-year survival rates can be as low as 40 percent. This makes breast cancer the highest cause of cancer deaths amongst Palestinian women.*"
- 4.3. MAP's comparison between the Palestinian territories and the UK or Israel is misleading. An article in the International Journal of Surgery on "*Trends in epidemiology and management of breast cancer in developing Arab countries*" published in August 2007 showed that the situation regarding breast cancer in the Palestinian territory was similar to the situation in other Arab countries not "under military occupation".<sup>73</sup> This study found that "*Advanced disease remains very common in Egypt, Tunisia, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Palestinian Territories and others*" and that "*Breast cancer is the most common cancer among women in Arab countries with a young age of around 50 years at presentation.*"
- 4.4. In general, there is a higher incidence of breast cancer in developed countries and a better survival rate. A 2017 survey of cancer incidence in the USA, Turkey, Israel and Jordan concluded that breast cancer incidence varied widely among the four participating countries with the highest rates occurring in Jewish Israeli women (100.4/100,000) and the lowest rates in Turkish women (50.7/100,000). The US rates were similar to those of Israeli Jewish women and considerably higher than those observed in Israeli Arab, Turkish and Jordanian women.<sup>74</sup>

<sup>71</sup> <http://www.jpost.com/Arab-Israeli-Conflict/Terrorists-killed-20-Israelis-in-2017-533008>

<sup>72</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/downloads/map-breast-cancer-fact-sheet.pdf>

<sup>73</sup> [http://www.journal-surgery.net/article/S1743-9191\(06\)00142-7/abstract](http://www.journal-surgery.net/article/S1743-9191(06)00142-7/abstract)

<sup>74</sup> <https://clinmedjournals.org/articles/ijwhw/international-journal-of-womens-health-and-wellness-ijwhw-3-045.pdf>

- 4.5. Similarly, the World Cancer Research Fund International compared more and less developed countries and found that considerably more women developed breast cancer in the developed world than in the non-developed world: 74.1 out of every 100,000 developed breast cancer in the developed world compared to 31.3 per 100,000 in the less developed world.<sup>75</sup>
- 4.6. It is therefore misleading for MAP to suggest that lower survival rate for breast cancer in the Palestinian territories than in developed countries is due to “the occupation”, and even more misleading to suggest that there is a high incidence of breast cancer in the Palestinian territories due to “the occupation”.

### **Blaming “the occupation” instead of social and cultural barriers**

- 4.7. Early diagnosis and screening programmes are some of the most important factors for breast cancer recovery, as MAP observes at page 2 of the “fact sheet”<sup>76</sup>. MAP also recognises that there are social and cultural reasons why Palestinian women do not attend screening sessions: *“A lack of public health information about breast cancer in Palestine contributes to the low attendance at screening programmes and frequent late diagnosis of the disease. Many women report fears about the impact that receiving a diagnosis of breast cancer will have on their family lives and their marriages. The belief that a diagnosis of breast cancer means inevitable death has also been associated with low screening attendance in Palestinian women.”*
- 4.8. Despite this, MAP’s “fact sheet” primarily and wrongly blames “the occupation” for deaths of Palestinian women from breast cancer.

### **Alleged shortage of medicines in Gaza**

- 4.9. Page 1 of the “fact sheet” claims that *“shortages of essential medicines ... constitute obstacles to continuous and effective treatment and care for Palestinian women with breast cancer.”* Page 2 states: *“Hospitals in Gaza suffer chronic shortages of many essential medicines due in part to the ongoing separation between the West Bank and Gaza and the financial crisis faced by the Ministry of Health, itself partly a result of Israel’s decade long closure policy. In the first half of 2016 an average of 30 per cent of essential medicines were at “zero stock” in Gaza, meaning that less than one month’s supply was left on shelves”.* The “fact sheet” continues: *“In August 2016 alone, 17 percent of cancer drugs were at zero stock in Gaza. When these vital medications run out in hospitals, patients face the stark choice of interrupting their treatment or paying themselves through the private sector.”*
- 4.10. This is misleading:
- a) Israel does not restrict the supply of medicines to Gaza. Furthermore, on average supply requests for medicines and light equipment are approved by Israel within 24-72 hours and delivered 24 hours later.<sup>77</sup> Since medicines are readily available from Israel at short notice, holding limited stock in Gaza is good inventory management. Moreover, many drugs quickly become outdated so it is good practice to keep the minimum necessary amount of stock.
  - b) The figures used by MAP in fact relate to stock levels at central warehousing in Gaza. Additional stocks are held at the hospitals, but MAP’s “fact sheet” wrongly implies that there is “zero stock” at the hospitals.

<sup>75</sup> <http://www.wcrf.org/int/cancer-facts-figures/comparing-more-less-developed-countries>

<sup>76</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/downloads/map-breast-cancer-fact-sheet.pdf>

<sup>77</sup> <http://embassies.gov.il/UnGeneva/NewsAndEvents/Pages/Humanitarian-situation-Gaza-Nov-2012.aspx>

- c) Recent shortages of medicines in Gaza have been due to disputes between Hamas and the PA and the PA's refusal to pay for supplies.<sup>78</sup>
- d) The PA has funds to pay for medicines but chooses to prioritise the payment of salaries to terrorists.<sup>79</sup>

### **Training Medical Professionals**

- 4.11. Page 3 of the MAP "fact sheet" claims, under the heading "Surgery" that "*The blockade imposes severe restrictions on the ability of medical professionals, including surgeons, to travel out to the West Bank and abroad to further develop their surgical skills.*"
- 4.12. This is misleading. In addition to the points made in paras. 3.5 -3.12 above, the WHO report of 2010 which MAP cites for claims made in the "fact sheet" states that "*No specialist surgeons are available for several types of cancer such as cancer of the oesophagus, pancreas and lungs.*"<sup>80</sup> These do not include breast cancer.

## **5. MAP REPORTS**

- 5.1. Reports published on MAP's website<sup>81</sup> include "*Healthcare Under Occupation*" ("HUO")<sup>82</sup> and "*No More Impunity*" ("NMI")<sup>83</sup>. These reports were produced by collaboration between MAP and organisations that are linked with the terrorist entity PFLP and they disseminate false propaganda.

### **MAP's partners**

- 5.2. Page 6 of the NMI report says it was produced with a coalition of human rights organisations including Al Haq, Addameer and PCHR. All three organisations are linked with the terrorist entity PFLP as described in section 2 above. Furthermore, their fact finding methodologies have been found unreliable, for example:
  - a) PCHR claimed that on 14 November 2012 "*an Israeli warplane fired a missile at a house... Two members of the family (a woman and a toddler) were killed and a child from the same family was wounded.*" A detailed UN analysis confirmed that Israeli weaponry did not cause the casualties. In a report by the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights,<sup>84</sup> the deaths are attributed to "*what appeared to be a Palestinian rocket that fell short of Israel.*"
  - b) PCHR accuse Israel of killing civilians when in fact they are members of terrorist groups, for example:
    - i. On 14 July 2014 PCHR described Adham Mohammed 'Abdul Fattah' Abdul Aal as a civilian who had been killed. The Fatah Al Nidal Brigades calls him a mujahid martyr.
    - ii. On 30 July 2014 PCHR described Mohammed Mahmoud al Astal as a civilian but Fatah identifies him as a martyr mujahid.

<sup>78</sup> <https://www.middleeastmonitor.com/20170916-un-gaza-patients-lives-at-risk-due-to-medical-shortages/>

<sup>79</sup> <https://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=1041>; <https://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=1005>

<sup>80</sup> [http://www.emro.who.int/images/stories/palestine/documents/WHO\\_report\\_Referral\\_of\\_Patients\\_from\\_Gaza\\_-\\_Data\\_and\\_Commentary\\_for\\_2010.pdf](http://www.emro.who.int/images/stories/palestine/documents/WHO_report_Referral_of_Patients_from_Gaza_-_Data_and_Commentary_for_2010.pdf) page 23

<sup>81</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/publications/programme-reports>

<sup>82</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/downloads/health-under-occupation---map-report-2017.pdf>

<sup>83</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/downloads/no-more-impunity--gazas-health-sector-under-attack.pdf>

<sup>84</sup> [http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/HRBodies/HRCouncil/RegularSession/Session22/A.HRC.22.35.Add.1\\_AV.pdf](http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/HRBodies/HRCouncil/RegularSession/Session22/A.HRC.22.35.Add.1_AV.pdf)

- iii. On 20 July PCHR implied that Mohammed Abdul Rahman Mahmoud Abu Hamad was a civilian but Fatah's Nidal Brigade call him a mujahid martyr.<sup>85</sup>
  - iv. Nizar Rayan, a senior Hamas military commander, and members of his family were killed in an IDF airstrike on 1 January 2009. Despite Rayan's status and the weapons stockpile located at his home, PCHR classified Rayan as a "civilian," called his death a "heinous crime", and demanded that its *"perpetrators and their military and political leaders must be prosecuted."*
- c) CAMERA (Campaign for Accuracy in Middle East Reporting in America), analysed the statistics on the 2008/9 Gaza conflict that had been provided by PCHR<sup>86</sup> and found many omissions and inaccuracies, showing that PCHR provided inaccurate information, classified known militant members of terrorist groups as civilians, and listed Fatah members who had been executed by Hamas as having been killed by Israelis.
- 5.3. Al Mezan was another partner of MAP in the production of the NMI report, together with PCHR. Statistics provided by Al Mezan during the 2014 Gaza war proved to be highly inaccurate and partisan. Many individuals identified by Al Mezan and others as "civilians" killed during the conflict were found to be combatants and members of terror groups.<sup>87</sup>

#### **Msabbeh Ambulance Incident**

- 5.4. The cover and pages 16 and 17 of the NMI report describe an ambulance from the Palestinian Ministry of Health being hit by a drone strike on 1 August 2014 in Msabbeh Neighbourhood in Rafah and an "innocent medical crew" of three being killed in the strike. Jaber Hassan Darabieh, an ambulance driver, and the father of one of the "medical workers" killed, is interviewed and gives an emotional testimony about finding out his son had been killed. A case study about the same incident, also featuring the same interview with Jaber Hassan Darabieh, is provided on page 16 of the HUU report.
- 5.5. This material is completely misleading. All of the "ambulance crew" were members of the Islamic Jihad terrorist organisation.<sup>88</sup> "Martyr posters" were issued after their death by Islamic Jihad, showing each of them in their Islamic Jihad uniforms.
- 5.6. MAP republished this material in the HUU report in 2017 and continues to disseminate both of these reports on its website, even though it was shown in 2015 that all members of the "ambulance crew" were Islamic Jihad terrorist operatives.
- 5.7. Even if this had been a genuine ambulance crew, its deployment related to a matter entirely outside MAP's charitable objects. As noted in para 1.4 above, these do not include medical care for injuries caused by armed conflict.

#### **Allegation that 511 Palestinians killed during the 2014 conflict did not receive medical assistance due to obstruction of ambulance access**

<sup>85</sup> <http://elderofziyon.blogspot.com/2014/09/3-more-fake-civilians-of-day.html>

<sup>86</sup> [http://www.camera.org/index.asp?x\\_print=1&x\\_context=2&x\\_outlet=118&x\\_article=1603](http://www.camera.org/index.asp?x_print=1&x_context=2&x_outlet=118&x_article=1603)

<sup>87</sup> Annex to "The 2014 Gaza Conflict – Factual and Legal Aspects" May 2015

<http://mfa.gov.il/ProtectiveEdge/Documents/PalestinianFatalities.pdf>;

[http://www.nytimes.com/2014/08/06/world/middleeast/civilian-or-not-new-fight-in-tallying-the-dead-from-the-gaza-conflict.html?\\_r=0](http://www.nytimes.com/2014/08/06/world/middleeast/civilian-or-not-new-fight-in-tallying-the-dead-from-the-gaza-conflict.html?_r=0); [http://www.camera.org/index.asp?x\\_context=2&x\\_outlet=118&x\\_article=2762](http://www.camera.org/index.asp?x_context=2&x_outlet=118&x_article=2762);

Lenny Ben-David, "Gazan Casualties: How Many and Who They Were" Jerusalem Center for Public Affairs, 2015 <http://jcpa.org/casualties-gaza-war/#sthash.KvyEUG6n.dpuf>

<sup>88</sup> <http://elderofziyon.blogspot.com/2015/07/annestys-gaza-health-workers-also.html#.vanmbvmqgkq>

- 5.8. At page 16 of the HUC report, MAP claims: “511 of the 2,217 Palestinians who were killed during the 2014 attacks never received medical assistance due to obstruction of ambulance access. Some of these people may have survived if paramedics had been able to reach them in time.” An infographic on the page repeats the same figures.
- 5.9. The reference given for this data in the footnotes to the HUC report is the NMI report, which provides the same information at its pages 2, 4, 15, 21 and 24. The allegation is also highlighted in the summary of the NMI report on MAP’s website. The NMI report in turn cites in its footnote 36 as the sole source of this information: “Numbers provided by Al Mezan [sic] from their own databases”. No explanation is given of how Al Mezan claims to have arrived at this figure.
- 5.10. Thus the sole source of this repeated allegation is an entirely unsubstantiated assertion of a partisan NGO whose data has been found to be highly unreliable.
- 5.11. In any event, this is a matter entirely outside MAP’s charitable objects: see para 1.4 above.

#### **Other content of the NMI report**

- 5.12. Much of the content of the NMI report relates to casualties of armed conflict, rather than the relief of sickness, and is therefore outside MAP’s charitable objects.

#### **Alleged shortage of medicines and medical disposables in Gaza**

- 5.13. Page 34 of the HUC report alleges “hospitals and clinics in Gaza have had to deal with constant stock shortages. In May 2017, 34% of essential medicines and 32% of medical disposables were at ‘zero stock’ in Gaza, meaning that less than a month’s supply was available [sic].”
- 5.14. This is misleading, as explained in paragraph 4.10 above.

### **6. NEWS STORIES**

- 6.1. MAP posts on its website numerous “news” items consisting of political propaganda that does not promote MAP’s charitable objects.<sup>89</sup>
- 6.2. For example, a post dated 22 May 2018 is entitled “MPs interrogate government over decision to abstain on UN Gaza vote”. This item has nothing to do with any of MAP’s charitable objects. The same applies to the items entitled “UK abstains on creation of UN Commission of Inquiry into violations of international law in Gaza” (18 May 2018), “MAP joins 90+ organisations to call for Commission of Inquiry into violence against Gaza protestors” (17 May 2018), “Deadliest day in Gaza since 2014: devastating injuries and medics under attack” (18 May 2018) and “Deadliest day in Gaza since 2014: at least 58 Palestinians killed and 2,771 injured” (15 May 2018). Many of the other items are similarly outside MAP’s charitable objects.
- 6.3. In addition, these and other items contain thoroughly misleading propaganda. For example, the item entitled “Deadliest day in Gaza since 2014: devastating injuries and medics under attack” (18 May 2018) refers to 60 Palestinians killed on 14 May 2018 “by Israeli forces targeting demonstrators”, even though
- a) Dr Salah Albardarwil, a senior official of the Hamas terrorist organisation, had admitted

<sup>89</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive>

that 50 of those killed that day were Hamas activists<sup>90</sup>;

- b) the terrorist organisation Islamic Jihad had confirmed that a further 3 of those killed were from its military wing;<sup>91</sup>
- c) the leader of Hamas in Gaza, Yahya Sinwar, had announced at the outset “*We will take down the border with Israel and we will tear out their hearts from their bodies*”<sup>92</sup>; instructions were published on Facebook to knock down the border fence, carry concealed weapons and capture Israeli soldiers or residents<sup>93</sup>; and numerous violent attempts were made to breach the border.<sup>94</sup>

#### 6.4. Similar examples include:

- a) a post on 31 March 2018 which described the activities as “*a series of mass peaceful protests*”<sup>95</sup>;
- b) a press release on 1 April 2018 which stated that MAP “*condemns the killing and injuring of unarmed civilians in Gaza*” and reported that “*15 Palestinians have been killed*,”<sup>96</sup> but failed to note that at least 10 of these were affiliated with Hamas and had been engaged in terrorism when they were shot<sup>97</sup>;
- c) a news story on 7 April 2018 which stated that: “*Medical Aid for Palestinians (MAP) continues to condemn the killing and injuring of unarmed civilians, as Israel again responded violently to the Great Return March protests on Friday 6 April*”<sup>98</sup>, when the Palestinians targeted by the Israelis were not “unarmed” but were engaged in violent riots, throwing stones, Molotov cocktails, and firebombs, and attempting to breach the security fence;<sup>99</sup>
- d) a news story on 12 April 2018 describing the incidents on 6 April 2018 as “*a series of mass peaceful protests*”<sup>100</sup>

## 7. SEVEN JEWISH CHILDREN – A PLAY FOR GAZA

- 7.1. MAP’s website has promoted Caryl Churchill’s antisemitic play “*Seven Jewish Children – A Play for Gaza*”, inviting its supporters to stage a production and then ask for donations<sup>101</sup>.

<sup>90</sup> <https://www.haaretz.com/middle-east-news/palestinians/50-of-dead-in-gaza-protest-were-hamas-activists-says-hamas-official-1.6094899>; <https://www.algemeiner.com/2018/05/16/hamas-leader-in-gaza-identifies-50-palestinians-killed-during-gaza-border-confrontations-as-members-of-terror-group/>. See also the detailed analysis by the Meir Amit

Intelligence and Terrorism Information Center [http://www.terrorism-info.org.il/app/uploads/2018/05/E\\_129\\_18.pdf](http://www.terrorism-info.org.il/app/uploads/2018/05/E_129_18.pdf)

<sup>91</sup> <https://www.timesofisrael.com/hamas-official-50-of-the-people-killed-in-gaza-riots-were-members/>

<sup>92</sup> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Xs1Q9GnRdUY>

<sup>93</sup> [http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc\\_id=25638](http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc_id=25638)

<sup>94</sup> <http://high-level-military-group.org/pdf/hlmq-smoke-mirrors-six-weeks-violence-gaza-border.pdf>

<sup>95</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/816-map-dismayed-by-loss-of-life-responding-to-high-number-of-casualties-in-gaza>; cf the analysis by the Meir Amit Center cited at note 90

<sup>96</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/817-after-deadliest-day-in-gaza-since-2014-map-calls-for-accountability-for-killing-of-protesters>

<sup>97</sup> [https://twitter.com/IDFSpokesperson?ref\\_src=twsrc%5Egoogle%7Ctwcamp%5Eserp%7Ctwgr%5Eauthor](https://twitter.com/IDFSpokesperson?ref_src=twsrc%5Egoogle%7Ctwcamp%5Eserp%7Ctwgr%5Eauthor); and cf the analysis by the Meir Amit Center cited at note 90

<sup>98</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/821-gaza-update-at-least-8-palestinians-killed-and-hundreds-injured-mapas-team-responding>

<sup>99</sup> [https://twitter.com/IDFSpokesperson?ref\\_src=twsrc%5Egoogle%7Ctwcamp%5Eserp%7Ctwgr%5Eauthor](https://twitter.com/IDFSpokesperson?ref_src=twsrc%5Egoogle%7Ctwcamp%5Eserp%7Ctwgr%5Eauthor). At least 26 of the 32 Palestinians killed on 30 March and 6 April were members of terrorist organisations: [http://www.terrorism-info.org.il/app/uploads/2018/04/E\\_091\\_18.pdf](http://www.terrorism-info.org.il/app/uploads/2018/04/E_091_18.pdf); [http://www.terrorism-info.org.il/app/uploads/2018/05/E\\_129\\_18.pdf](http://www.terrorism-info.org.il/app/uploads/2018/05/E_129_18.pdf)

<sup>100</sup> <https://www.map.org.uk/news/archive/post/824-responding-to-mass-casualties-in-gaza-thanks-to-your-support>

<sup>101</sup> [https://web.archive.org/web/20110519084029/http://www.map.org.uk/get\\_involved/perform\\_seven\\_jewish\\_children\\_for\\_map/](https://web.archive.org/web/20110519084029/http://www.map.org.uk/get_involved/perform_seven_jewish_children_for_map/)

7.2. The antisemitic and inflammatory nature of the play has been described by numerous reviewers:

- a) When the play was first performed at the Royal Court Theatre in London in 2009, The Jewish Chronicle's theatre reviewer, John Nathan, wrote: *"For the first time in my career as a critic, I am moved to say about a work at a major production house that this is an anti-semitic play."*<sup>102</sup>
- b) Howard Jacobson writing in the Independent on 18 February 2009<sup>103</sup> called it a *"wantonly inflammatory piece"* where *"the Jews drop in on somewhere they have no right to be, despise, conquer, and at last revel in the spilling of Palestinian blood."* He continues: *"lie follows lie, omission follows omission, until, in the tenth and final minute, we have a stage populated by monsters who kill babies by design – 'Tell her we killed the babies by mistake,' one says, meaning don't tell her what we really did – who laugh when they see a dead Palestinian policeman ('Tell her they're animals... Tell her I wouldn't care if we wiped them out'), who consider themselves the 'chosen people', and who admit to feeling happy when they see Palestinian 'children covered in blood'"*.
- c) Jeffrey Goldberg writing in *The Atlantic*, called the play a blood libel<sup>104</sup> and commented that: *"The mainstreaming of the worst anti-Jewish stereotypes -- for instance, that Jews glory in the shedding of non-Jewish blood -- is upon us."*
- d) Dave Rich and Mark Gardner of the Community Security Trust (a charity that monitors antisemitism and provides security for the UK Jewish community) wrote an article for the Guardian's *"Comment is Free"* section explaining how the play brought the blood libel against the Jews up-to-date and culminated in powerful antisemitic resonances.<sup>105</sup>

5 June 2018



Jonathan  
Turner  
Chief  
Executive  
UK Lawyers  
for Israel  
3 Stone  
Buildings,  
Lincoln's Inn,  
London WC2A  
3XL  
[info@uklfi.com](mailto:info@uklfi.com)

Brooke Goldstein  
Executive Director  
The Lawfare Project  
633 Third Avenue, 21<sup>st</sup>  
Floor  
New York, NY 10017  
USA  
[info@thelawfareproject.org](mailto:info@thelawfareproject.org)



<sup>102</sup> <https://www.thejc.com/review-seven-jewish-children-1.7642?highlight=seven+jewish+children>

<sup>103</sup> <http://www.independent.co.uk/voices/commentators/howard-jacobson/howard-jacobson-letsquos-see-the-criticism-of-israel-for-what-it-really-is-1624827.html>

<sup>104</sup> <http://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2009/02/the-royal-court-theatre-apos-s-blood-libel/9521/>

<sup>105</sup> <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2009/may/01/carylchurchill-theatre>